DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA BOARD OF ZONING ADJUSTMENT 441 4th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20001

Appeal by B Monroe Ventures LLC

BZA Appeal No. 19613

D.C. DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS' PRE-HEARING STATEMENT

The D.C. Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs ("DCRA") respectfully requests that the Board of Zoning Adjustment ("Board") deny this appeal for the following reasons:

Appellant B Monroe Ventures LLC alleges that the Zoning Administrator erred in his determination that the proposed building at 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. ("Building") is required to provide a side yard.¹ The Zoning Administrator correctly determined that the Building is required to provide a side yard because it is a semi-detached building with a free-standing side on the western lot line.

Factual and Procedural Background

On April 26, 2017, Appellant submitted building permit application No. B1707642 ("Application"), which sought authorization for the following work at 1842 Monroe Street, N.W. and 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. (collectively, "Property"): "construct new three story, two family flat in conjunction with 1842 Monroe St." (Exhibit 1 – Application B1707642, dated Apr. 26, 2017.) The Property is located in the RF-1 Zone (formerly called R-4 zone). In the instant case, 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. will be attached to the common division wall to be constructed on its east side with 1842 Monroe Street, N.W.² The proposed construction of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., has 1844 Monroe Street's west wall up to the property line.³ However, the property to the west of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., 1850 Monroe Street, is a detached building with a side yard of approximately 25 feet along the western lot line of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W.⁴

On May 26, 2017, Appellant submitted a written request to the Zoning Administrator asking whether 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. would require a side yard because the zoning

¹ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

² BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

³ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

⁴ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

reviewer commented that 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. would need a side yard since it is not attached on the west side.⁵

On July 28, 2017, after a careful review of the submitted plans, the Zoning Administrator determined that, in accordance with 11-E DCMR § 307.1 and 11-B DCMR § 100.2, the proposed Building is required to provide a side yard on its west side because it is a semi-detached building and shares no common division wall with the property to its west, 1850 Monroe Street.⁶ Following the Zoning Administrator's determination, Appellant filed this appeal on August 21, 2017.⁷

On November 15, 2017, the co-owners of 1850 Monroe Street, N.W. ("Intervenor's Property"), which abuts the west side of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., filed their Request for Intervenor in Opposition.⁸ The Board granted Intervenor Status Request on May 2, 2018.⁹

Argument

Appellant alleges that the Zoning Administrator erred in his interpretation of the plain meaning of 11-E DCMR § 307.1 when the Zoning Administrator determined that the Building must provide a side yard. The Zoning Administrator correctly determined that the Building is a semi-detached building, which is required to provide a side yard on its free-standing western side.

The Property consists of two unimproved vacant lots, on which Appellant plans to construct two buildings – 1842 Monroe Street, N.W. and the Building. (Exhibit 2 – architectural plans submitted to ZA as part of the Application, dated Apr. 26, 2017.) The proposed property at 1842 Monroe Street is an attached building. An attached building is a building that abuts or shares walls on both side lot lines with other buildings on adjoining lots.¹⁰ As depicted on the plans, the proposed building at 1842 Monroe Street, N.W. shares a common division wall with 1840 Monroe (an existing neighbor's house) to the east and 1844 Monroe to the west.¹¹ Therefore, 1842 Monroe Street, N.W. shares a common division wall on both sides and a side yard is not required.

⁵ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 4A - Exhibit Tab A - Question to ZA

⁶ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

⁷ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 2 – Appeal Statement

⁸ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 23 - Request for Intervenor in Opposition from Donna Murphy and Keenan Keller

⁹ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 33 - BZA Memo re: Granting Intervenor Status

¹⁰ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 33 - BZA Memo re: Granting Intervenor Status

¹¹ BZA Appeal 19613 Exhibit 33 - BZA Memo re: Granting Intervenor Status; 11B DCMR § 100.2.

BZA Appeal 19613 - DCRA's Pre-Hearing Statement

In contrast, the proposed Building, 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., is required to have a side yard because it is a semi-detached building. A semi-detached building is "a building that abuts or shares one (1) wall, on a side lot line, with another building on an adjoining lot and where the remaining sides of the building are surrounded by open areas or street lot lines."¹² The Building, 1844 Monroe Street, has a common division wall on only one side-the side abutting 1842 Monroe Street, N.W. The property to the west of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., 1850 Monroe Street, is a detached building with a side yard of approximately 25 feet along the western lot line of 1844 Monroe Street, N.W.¹³ Since there is no existing wall along the property line between 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. and 1850 Monroe Street, N.W., 1844 Monroe Street must have a side yard.

Appellant's arguments fail to mention that the Zoning Administrator has to consider the character of the neighborhood and the zoning definitions. According to Appellant, the block where this construction is to occur is located in the Mount Pleasant Historic District and consists primarily of lot-line to lot-line row dwellings.¹⁴ Appellant further argues that after 1842 Monroe Street, N.W is built, the Building, located at 1844 Monroe Street, N.W., would share a common division wall and therefore, 1844 Monroe would not be subject to the side yard requirement.¹⁵ Appellant's argument simple ignores the fact that the proposed Building is considered a "semidetached" building rather than a "row dwelling."

Any possible change in the Zoning Administrator's interpretation of when a building must provide a side yard likely stems from the new definitions found in the 2016 Zoning Regulations. Under the 1958 Zoning Regulations, a "row dwelling" was defined as "a onefamily dwelling having no side yards."¹⁶ Based on this definition, the Zoning Administrator reviewed proposed plans based on where the building was located in relation to its own lot lines. The 2016 Zoning Regulations, however, changed the Zoning Administrator's analysis when it created definitions for attached buildings and semi-detached buildings. Specifically, these definitions changed the analysis from where the building is located in relation to its own lot lines to the building's relationship to the neighboring buildings.

 ¹²Title 11-B DCMR § 100.2. Semi-detached building is written as "Building- Semi-detached."
 ¹³ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 4B

¹⁴ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 2

¹⁵ BZA Appeal 19613- Exhibit 2

¹⁶ Title 11-1 DCMR § 199

Second, 11-E DCMR § 307.1 requires a side yard on the western lot line of the Building because the Building's west side wall is a free-standing wall. Per 11-E DCMR § 307.1, "when a new dwelling or flat is erected that does not share a common division wall with an existing building or a building being constructed together with the new building, it shall have a side yard on each resulting free-standing side." Here, the Building should have a side yard on its west free-standing side because the western side of the Building neither shares a common division wall with an existing building nor with a building being constructed together with it. The Building's free-standing side abuts a side yard along the property line of the Intervenor's Property. Contrary to the Appellant's assertion, the plain meaning of the language of 11-E DCMR § 307.1 requires the Building to provide a side yard on its western lot line. Therefore, the Building should have a side yard because, first, it is a semi-detached building with a free-standing wall on its western lot line and, second, the western free-standing side does not share a common division wall with either an existing building or a building being constructed with it.

Conclusion

For the foregoing reasons, DCRA respectfully requests that the Board (1) affirm that the Zoning Administrator correctly determined that 1844 Monroe Street, N.W. must provide a side yard pursuant to the Zoning Regulations; and (2) deny this appeal.

Respectfully submitted, ESTHER YONG MCGRAW Interim General Counsel Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs

Date: <u>6/6/2018</u>

/s/ Adrianne Lord-Sorensen ADRIANNE LORD-SORENSEN (DC Bar # 493865) Assistant General Counsel Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs Office of the General Counsel 1100 4th Street, S.W., 5th Floor Washington, D.C. 20024 (202) 442-8401 (office) (202) 442-9447 (fax)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on this $\underline{6}^{\text{th}}$ day of June 2018 a copy of "DCRA's Pre-Hearing Statement" was served via electronic mail to:

Martin P. Sullivan Alexandra Wilson Sullivan & Barros 1990 M Street, N.W., Suite 200 Washington, D.C. 20036 <u>msullivan@sullivanbarros.com</u> <u>awilson@sullivanbarros.com</u> *Counsel for Appellant*

Kennan Keller and Donna M. Murphy 1850 Monroe Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20010 <u>Murphy.keller@verizon.net</u> *Intervenor* Yasmin Romero-Latin, Chair Advisory Neighborhood Commission 1D 3145 Mount Pleasant Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20010 <u>1D04@anc.dc.gov</u>

Jack McKay, Single Member Advisory Neighborhood Commissioner, ANC 1D03 3200 19th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20010 <u>1D03@anc.dc.gov</u>

/s/ Adrianne Lord-Sorensen Adrianne Lord-Sorensen

EXHIBIT 1

D	0 4
Page	ot A
Page 1	

Menu	Save	Reset	Cancel	Help		
Record Deta	il • (This se	ection is required)			
Permit No. B1707642 Descriptio CONSTRI	B n of Wark	ermit Type uilding/Construct REE STORY, TV		•		s w In Process 642 MONROE ST
Total Fee I 1,435.50	nvoiced Tota 1,43		Balance 0.00	Opened 0 04/26/201		President and and the state of
Address ' Search	(This section Reset	is required) Clear	Get Parce	a & Owner	Address Loc	ator XY GIS Locator
Street # * 1844 Unit Type - Select- Cluster Zone	M	reet Name · DNROE it # S Neighbor ANC	street # (end) hood	Street 1 ST Start Fractio Select Ext	v∏ n Zip Cod v	Constitution and a set of shares () have an any property spectrum."
Premise Ph	none Number	l	e i maneri han i escala para an eve sant i			
Primary Yes Parcel 110-5 Search	section is no Reset	Liegurea (Clear				
SSL ·	Lot	w	ard	Primary		
2614 0849	0849		Carried Internet (Part and address)	Yes	\checkmark	
Owner This Search	section is no Reset	tregu <i>r</i> ed) Clear				
Name *				Primary		
B MONROE V	ENTURES			Yes	V	
Address Line				Phone ()	(XX)XXX-XXXX	
1120 PARK R Address Line		····· 40 ····· · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Mail City WASHINGTO Cell Phone		and the second sec	ail Zip	Country United States		v J
Centrione			FORD@GMAIL	CQ		
Professionals	This section	on is not required	cj.			
Search	Reset	Clear				
License # ·	Firs	t Name	Middle	Name	Last Name	an summer and the summer and an and the summer of the summer of
License Typ	e Bus	iness Name			Phon	e 1 ((XXX)XXX-XXXX)
Select Primary	Add	lress Line 1	an a	9999 11-1999 (11-1997) (11-1997)	Phon	e 2 ((X×X)XXX-XXXX)
Yes	Add	iress Line 2]
	City	n ander der einer einen der Annen der der Andersagen und der Angeleichen der Angeleichen der Angeleichen der An Mehr Meisterne der Angeleichen der Ansteinen der Angeleichen der Angeleichen der Angeleichen der Angeleichen der		State	Zip C	ode
	Ema	il		[Ι	
	L		diffe outer a many a self- transmission			
Agent for Own Search	er • (763 s As Owner	action is required As Lic. Pro		act		
Туре		rst Name LIFF		ddle Name	Last Name DIXON	
Relationship	And the second s	Ill Name	n er en samer er annen er annen af an er annen af a			1. 11. 11. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1.
Select Primary	terest to contract the first mark Taken	LIFF DIXON rganization Nan	18	ef regine i constant al la sacca cadagate bacadas de		
Yes	~					
	2	dress Line 1 120 S POLLARD dress Line 2	ST			Phone 1 ((XXX)XXX-XXXX) (202) 705-1453 Phone 2 ((XXX)XXX-XXXX)
	Ac	dress Line 3				Fax ((XXX)XXX - XXXX)

Cit	y Shburn	State VA	Zip Code 22202			
En	ail XONCLIFFORD@GMAIL.CO	MC				
App Specific Info						
LANAGUAGE PREFERENCE						
Language Preference	Other					
English V	[]				
GENERAL INFORMATION SE	CTION					
	anni Lenano Len		Number of plans	File Room Bin No E	xpiration Date	Related to Stop Work Order
An other statements to be the state of the state of the statement of the state of t	O Yes O No C-R	<u> </u>			a alternative and reading the second second] O Yes O No
Existing use of building or p Other (Specify)	roperty	general and the second second second	d use of building or pro mily Flat - R-3	perty	3	
Proposed number of stories		posed Stories Plus			Proposed number of	of dwelling units
3	- Martine Antonio Martine Antonio Provincia de Carto de	elect 🗸	N	Stories Penthouse	2	
Existing number of stories o	f building Exis	ting Stories plus			Existing number of	dwelling units
0	5	elect 🗸	Existing St	ories Penthouse	0	
Completion date of work	Construction start o	late				
Number of Continue of Column	L					
Number of Footings or Colur	nns Size of Footing	s or Columns	Wall Check Com		eck Required	
Application Comments			🔾 Yes 🖗 No	⊖ Yes	I No	
		e or word the effective second constant	and a second set of the second determine to the	and all the second s		
DOE SECTION						
Method of moving constructi	on debris (Other	Specify				
Other						
Type of construction materia	Other (Specify type	of material)	Does the proposed	work involve disturbing	the earth or razing a b	uilding *
-Seleci-	✓]]	Select			~
(A) is the area of disturbed ea	rth more than 50 sq. ft.	(B) Soi	il erosion control metho	ds (C) Area of off	fsite drainage	
Select	×	[SOFT	
Present gross floor area of th s projection beyond building Select- C) Width of projection	SOFT	ed gross floor area er and type of proje rontage	SOFT	Floors involved with -Select istance of projection	✓ Lota	rt area percentage - Building ma percentage - Greenery rea percentage - Paved Area
FT		FT	L	T.		
DDITIONAL INFO SECTION	-					
Vater or sewer excavation	Driveway construction		shoring necessary	New or repair elevato	and the second sec	
	O Yes O No levators	O Yes O I	No	Select	<u>~</u>	
O Yes O No	A contract of the second state of the second s					
Long the lon	the energy of the distance of the second states of					
F CALCULATION SECTION						
E CALCULATION SECTION stimated cost of construction	n Length Wi	dth Heig	ht Total Numb	er of Floors		
200000	58 FT 50	and the standard large ground and	FT 3			
olume of new building or add	see Recompensation and management because	denotation and the second science of	Retaining Wall cons	truction cost		
87000	CU FT 200000]	(
OOH Plan Review Square Feet	Required for Plan Review	the second se	DOH Plan Review Type			
2900		SQFT	-Select	$\mathbf{\mathbf{v}}$		
REEN BUILDING SECTION						
Freen Building	Public Financing	Project Ty	many A particularly department in the local frame of the period of the second statement	manage frances	al Area for Green Build	ling Fee
🔿 Yes 🔍 No	🔿 Yes 🖲 No	Residentia	31	✓ 870	0	ALL COLOR
wher Type	Green Building S	tandards				
Select V EED Cerification Level	Select	Engrass Ster 7	✓	Is the Project Substantia	limoroupperst	
-Select	\mathbf{v}	Energy Star F	samg (1-100)	O Yes O No	improvement	
		L		U Yes U No		
JTHORIZED AGENT						
an Agent Authorized						
Yes O No						
NTRACTOR Lot Vacant? Is General Con	tractor Information Availab	1-2				

DOEE ENVIRONMENTAL QUESTIONS Work performed involve the installation, removal, close-in-place now, or repair of UST system Work performed involve assessm, of soil/soil-vapor/cleanup assoc, w/released material fror O Yes @ No O Yes @ No Work performed involve assessm./clean-up of groundwater assoc. w/release of material from an UST Will proposed work involve install/drilling of wells other than for purposes in above questio O Yes @ No O Yes @ No Does work involve drilling of well using air rotary drilling or method discharging gas/dust in air Does project involve generation/treatm./storage/disposal/transport of hazard, chemicals/suit O Yes @ No C Yes @ No Does project involve constr. of facility involv, handling of solid/medical waste/recycl. material Does project involve constr. result. in discharge to/withdrawal from/disturb sediment in wat O Yes @ No O Yes O No Does project involve constr. affecting aquatic/terrestrial biota and their habitat/water quality Does project site contain a species of plant or animal that is federally protected C Yes @ No O Yes @ No Does project result in arial discharge of gases/dust or the creation of any objectionable odors Was the building built before 1978 (Lead paint may be present). O Yes No. O Yes No Does the building contain asbestos Does the project disturb 5,000 square feet or greater of land O Yes (No O Yes @ No Is project interior reno./add, & assessed value of structure is > 50% of the total constr. cost Does project's total cost exceed 100% of structure's assessed value. AND is zone other that () Yes (No () Yes @ No Is project within a Special Flood Hazard Area or 100-year floodplain area Will project result in the install of fuel burning equip/boilers w/input ratings >5 million BTU/I O Yes @ No O Yes @ No Does project result in constr./installation of any other stationary pollution emitting equipment Signature O Yes @ No CLIFFORD DIXON (Texi) Date 04/26/2017 ENVIRONMENTAL INTAK FORM is this project a residential structure within R-1 through R-5-A zoning districts Is this project a single family structure not built in conjunction with 2 or more units Yes O No C Yes @ No Is this project an accessory structure, such as a garage, patio, pool, or fence Is this project only an interior renovation with no building use or capacity change TYPE TO NO) Yes 🕑 No Is project in an Economic Development Zone, defined in DC Official Code 6-1501 (DC Law 7-177) Is this project in the Central Employment Area, defined in DC Zoning Regulations () Yes (No O Yes @ No Project involve only repair minor all of public facility with minor or no expans, of existing use Does the owner of this site own adjacent or abutting property O Yes (No C Yes (No Do you plan to develop adjacent abutting property in next 3 years Do you plan more development that requires permit(s) on any site in this square in next 3 years O Yes (No () Yes () No Is this project a solid waste facility Have you prepared an EIS or a functional equivalent, as required by the NEPA act of 1969 () Yes () No () Yes (No Are you claiming an exemption from the requirement to submit an ESF under Title 20 7202 Is the total project cost more than \$1.9 million, including site preparation and construction O Yes @ No O Yes (No For projects with a total cost of \$1.9 million or less, check all that apply from A thru G (A) Contains threatened or endangered plant or animal species O Yes @ No O Yes () No (B) Is within 100 feet of a pond, stream, lake, spring, or wetland (C) Project will produce emission of odorous, other air pollulants (from any source, including VC O Yes @ No () Yes () No (D) Project will produce, use, or dispose of hazardous substances, as defined in 20 DCMR 7299 (E) Will be built on land where the water table depth is less than 3 feet O Yes (No O Yes @ No (F) Will require blasting (G) Will generate medical, infectious, radioactive, or hazardous waste O Yes @ No O Yes () No Signature of Owner or Authorized Agent Date CLIFFORD DIXON 04/26/2017 (Text) General Information Is this Project being submitted for a 3rd Party Review Select all floors involved in proposed construction O Yes @ No **FP** Condition Is area of disturbed earth more than 5000 Soft --Select-- V --Select-- V

Total work area affected by proposed construction
Total work area affected by proposed construction
(Text)
Flood Proofing Certificate Required
Yes O No
Slab or Lowest floor EC/FC Certificate Review
Select

ZONING DATA SUMMARY Existing Number of Dwelling Units (Number) Existing Number of Parking Spaces(9x19) (Number) Existing Left Side Yard Setback (Number) Proposed Left Side Yard Setback Existing Rear Yard Setback [FT_(Number) Is area of disturbed earth more than 5000 Sqft --Select-- ✓ Elevation Certificate Required ○ Yes ○ No Do you have a completed Flood Hazard Development Form ○ Yes ○ No Final Completion of the Project EC/FC Certificate Review --Select-- ✓

Proposed Number of Dwelling Units (Number) Proposed Number of Parking Spaces(9x19) (Number) Existing Right Side Yard Setback Proposed Right Side Yard Setback Proposed Rear Yard Setback

Edit Record By Single

Existing Building Height (Feet)	Existing Building Height (Stories)
FT (Numb	er) (Number)
Proposed Building Height (Feet)	Proposed Building Height (Stories)
FT. (Numb	er) (Number)
Existing Lot Area	Proposed Lot Area
SQFT (Nur	nber) SQFT (Number)
Existing Gross Floor Area	Proposed Gross Floor Area
SQFT (Nur	nber) SQFT (Number)
Existing Floor Area Ratio	Proposed Floor Area Ratio
(Number)	(Number)
Existing Building Footprint	Proposed Building Footprint
SQFT (Nur	nber) SOFT (Number)
Existing Lot Occupancy	Proposed Lot Occupancy
% (Number) % (Number)
Previous surface (R-1 through R-4)	Green Area Ratio (R-5 and above)
% (Number) (Number)

Group

Туре

Structures (This section is not required i

Name

D	ID		
		 20	202

Related Records

Record ID	Short Notes	Permit Type	Status	Opened Date	Priority	Street Name	First Name	Last Name	E-mail	Dir
17NEW-00000-06703		Building/Construction/New Building/NA	Review In Process	04/26/2017		MONROE	CLIFF	DIXON	DIXO	NW
17NEW-00000-06705		Building/Construction/New Building/NA	Review In Process	04/26/2017		MONROE	CLIFF	DIXON	DIXO .	NW

Status Date

Land Use

Status

1

2

Submit Cancel

Description Record Status

https://aclprod.in.dc.gov/portlets/cap/CapBySingle.do?mode=edit&fromModel=myCap&m... 6/6/2018

EXHIBIT 2



